



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### 'Edinburgh and World Christianity'

**Citation for published version:**

Stanley, B 2011, "Edinburgh and World Christianity", *Studies in World Christianity*, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 72-91.  
<https://doi.org/10.3366/swc.2011.0006>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.3366/swc.2011.0006](https://doi.org/10.3366/swc.2011.0006)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

**Published In:**

Studies in World Christianity

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

©Stanley, B. (2011). 'Edinburgh and World Christianity'. *Studies in World Christianity*, 17(1), 72-91 doi: 10.3366/swc.2011.0006

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



BRIAN STANLEY

## Edinburgh and World Christianity

### ABSTRACT

In his inaugural lecture as Professor of World Christianity at the University of Edinburgh, Professor Stanley discusses three individuals connected to Edinburgh who have major symbolic or actual significance for the development of world Christianity over the last 150 years. Tiyo Soga (1829–71) studied in Edinburgh for the ministry of the United Presbyterian Church, and became the first black South African to be ordained into the Christian ministry. His Edinburgh theological training helped to form his keen sense of the dignity and divine destiny of the African race. Yun Chi'ho (1865–1945) was the sole Korean delegate at the World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910. His political career illustrates the ambiguities of the connection that developed between Christianity and Korean nationalism under Japanese colonial rule. John Alexander Dowie (1847–1907) was a native of Edinburgh and a student of the University of Edinburgh who went on to found a utopian Christian community near Chicago – 'Zion City'. This community and Dowie's teachings on the healing power of Christ were formative in the origins of Pentecostal varieties of Christianity in both southern and West Africa.

*Keywords:* Tiyo Soga, Xhosa, Ch'iho Yun, Korea, John Alexander Dowie, Pentecostal healing

Most mornings I travel to Edinburgh on the train from my home in Fife with the great-grandson of Harry Kambwiri Matecheta, one of the

*Studies in World Christianity* 17.1 (2011): 72–91

DOI: 10.3366/swc.2011.0006

© Edinburgh University Press

[www.eupjournals.com/swc](http://www.eupjournals.com/swc)

first two Malawians to be ordained to the Presbyterian ministry. Ninety-nine years ago, in 1911, Matecheta, along with Stephen Kundecha, was ordained to the presbyterate by Church of Scotland missionaries from the Blantyre Mission.<sup>1</sup> This afternoon, his great-grandson, Max Kalamula, is with us here in Edinburgh in the city in which he works. There can be few, if any, cities in the United Kingdom, and very few even in Europe, which have such strong and multiple connections with the story of the growth of the Christian Church in Africa and Asia over the last 150 years or so. In this lecture I propose to explore just a few of those connections relating to three individuals whom I have selected for their actual or symbolic significance for the development of world Christianity. On first impression, this may appear as an unfashionably Eurocentric, indeed 'Edina-centric', approach to the modern history of world Christianity, as if the story could adequately be told in terms of a new and specifically Scottish history of the acts of the apostles, radiating outwards from the New Jerusalem of Edinburgh.<sup>2</sup> However, I hasten to add that only one of the three individuals I have selected was a Scot. One was a Korean, and the other, with whom I begin, was a Xhosa from the deep south of Africa. The city, and to a lesser extent, the university, of Edinburgh feature prominently in the lives of these three persons, but Edinburgh was not the sole or even the primary source of the respective contributions they made to the history of world Christianity.

I: TIYO SOGA

On 3 February 1857 at a service at Bristo Street United Presbyterian Church in Edinburgh, several missionaries were set apart for the work of the foreign mission field. What was unusual about this particular valedictory service was that one of those being commissioned was himself a black African. George Johnston, the minister who addressed the missionaries on that occasion, addressed Tiyo Soga, recently ordained as the first black South African to enter the Christian ministry, in the following terms:

You are going home to your fatherland, and to the tents of your own people. You came amongst us as a stranger, with your heart filled with love to God. You have studied in our college and in our hall, in order to prepare yourself for the great and glorious work of the ministry... Now that you are about to return to your own land, to proclaim the unsearchable riches of Christ to your countrymen, I am

sure that every heart in this assembly is beating with the deepest interest towards you, and sending up the earnest prayer in your behalf, that... you may be the means of converting thousands of them to the faith of the gospel; that you may be honoured to be the founder of an enduring and prospering church in Caffraria; and that generations yet unborn may arise and pronounce the name of Tiyo Soga with blessings on his head.<sup>3</sup>

Soga was, in the conventional parlance of the day, a 'Kaffir', a Xhosa from the troubled eastern frontier of the Cape Colony. The term 'Kaffir', and hence 'Caffraria', was first affixed to the Bantu-speaking peoples by the Muslim traders of the Indian Ocean coast. Originally an Arabic word for the unbelievers or literally the 'ungrateful' who did not know Allah, it had been transposed in the southern African context into a term applied by both Boers and British to their 'heathen' neighbours. The term did not necessarily carry at the time the full weight of derogatory racist sentiment which it subsequently acquired, and Tiyo Soga continued to use it of his own people throughout his life.

Born in 1829, this believing inhabitant of the so-called 'land of the unbelievers' owed his Christian faith to his parents, who were followers of the remarkable Xhosa prophet and hymn writer, Ntsikana.<sup>4</sup> His father, 'Old Soga', was the first Xhosa to use a plough and to irrigate his crops. He was a polygamist and pursued his own variety of Christianity that never conformed to missionary expectations. Tiyo's mother, Nosuthu, was, however, baptised by a missionary of the Glasgow Missionary Society, and sent her sons to be educated at the Society's school at Thyumie. In 1844 Tiyo was given a scholarship to the more advanced school or seminary which the Society opened at Lovedale in 1841. When Lovedale had to close in 1846 owing to the resumption of war between the Xhosa and the British, Soga was taken, with his mother's blessing, to Scotland, by William Govan, the principal. There he was enrolled for a year in a school at Inchinnan in Renfrewshire, before being sent for teacher training at the Free Church of Scotland Normal School. He was baptised in John Street United Presbyterian Church in Glasgow on 7 May 1848; the baptismal sermon was, appropriately, on the Ethiopian eunuch. On his return to the Cape Soga worked as an evangelist and catechist at Thyumie. He came to Scotland for a second time in June 1851 to prepare for ordination, studying both at the University of Glasgow and, from 1852, in the Synod Hall of the United Presbyterian Church at 5 Queen Street, Edinburgh.<sup>5</sup> He also married a Scottish wife, Janet Burnside. His ordination in John Street

Church on 23 December 1856 was memorable chiefly for the ordination prayer uttered by the minister, Revd Dr William Anderson, who had baptised him eight years earlier.<sup>6</sup> Soga's nineteenth-century biographer, John Aitken Chalmers, records the prayer as follows:

The old man seemed wild with excitement. With one hand resting on the woolly head of Tiyo, whilst the other was outstretched to heaven, he screeched out one of the most extraordinary prayers that ever fell from human lips. With a pathos and earnestness never surpassed, he offered supplications for the richest blessings to rest on his young Kafir brother. Then there was a sudden break to this thrilling devotion, and something followed very like a tirade against the colonial policy of England; the petitions seemed to bristle with scathing satire against Her Majesty's Government and the Premier, and the Colonial Secretary's name rang throughout the church, whilst his blundering acts were confessed as if by his own lips. In marked contrast were the supplications presented for *the noble Kafir chieftain, Sandilli*.<sup>7</sup>

Soga was being sent back as a missionary to his own people in a political context fraught by bitter conflicts over land between white settlers and Xhosa cattle-rearers. The sympathies of Dr Anderson, as of missionary opinion as a whole, were clearly with the Ngqika paramount chief, Sandile, and not with the British Colonial Secretary, Lord Glenelg, who had, until recently, connived at the expulsion by the Cape government of Sandile's people from their lands west of the Kei river. For Tiyo Soga, the son of Sandile's counsellor, Old Soga, the gospel he was being sent to proclaim could not be divorced from the issues of land rights that were beginning to tear Cape society apart. Neither could it be separated from the heritage of Ntsikana, which combined Christian faith with adherence to Xhosa cultural traditions. As he reflected on these matters, Soga found inspiration from one of his professors in the Synod Hall, John Brown. Brown was no longer at the height of his modest powers as a lecturer in exegetical theology, if the carefully chosen words of the historian of the institution are to be believed:

Shortly after the union of the Relief and the Secession Halls in 1847, the senior professor, Dr John Brown, began to be assailed by the infirmities of an old age that had been prematurely superinduced through the severity of his continuous application to study. There was no weakening of his intellectual powers, except in their *elasticity*;

and elasticity never had been a prominent characteristic of any of his faculties, which were strong rather than nimble or subtle.<sup>8</sup>

Nevertheless, Soga's notebooks for September 1856, which sadly do not survive,<sup>9</sup> include notes of a lecture by Brown on Romans 9: 3, 'a subject', Chalmers observes, 'which Tiyo often afterwards took as a theme of discourse in addressing his countrymen'.<sup>10</sup> We do not have the text of Brown's Edinburgh lectures on Romans, but there is evidence that they formed the basis of his commentary on the epistle, published in the following year.<sup>11</sup> What seems to have so impressed Soga were Brown's comments on Paul's statement that he would have been willing even to be accursed and cut off from Christ, if by so doing he could have achieved the salvation of his brethren, the Jews, his kinsmen by race. Christianity, observed Brown in his commentary,

does not unhinge the relations formed by nature; it draws them closer. It does not extinguish the affections which grow out of those relations; it regulates and sanctifies them . . . Paul, when he became a Christian, became a cosmopolite—a citizen of the world; but he did not cease to be a Jew. He became a philanthropist, but he continued a patriot.<sup>12</sup>

Brown's lectures taught Soga that there was solid New Testament authority for the compatibility of the universal gospel of Christ with particular national or ethnic allegiances. Donovan Williams has argued that Soga was a Christian apostle of negritude, the first public spokesperson in southern Africa of black consciousness.<sup>13</sup> In a private journal entry written in April 1865, which he later developed into an article published in the *King William's Town Gazette* on 11 May, Soga deployed biblical material to contest statements that John Aitken Chalmers, whom Soga counted as a friend, had made in the same newspaper, to the effect that the supposedly indolent and degenerate 'Kaffir race' was destined for ultimate racial extinction before the onward march of white civilisation. Soga argued that, on the contrary, according to the Bible—'the only Book whose predictions to me is law—Africa God has given to Ham and all his descendants . . . that nothing shall ever dispossess them of this inheritance—that God will keep the Kaffir in his Southern portion of it—and that God will so overrule events as always to secure this'.<sup>14</sup> The prediction of Psalm 68: 31 that 'Ethiopia shall soon stretch out her hands to God' was, insisted Soga in his newspaper article, 'the sheet-anchor of the Church of Christ', a guarantee that the gloomy forecasts of white racial theory would not come to pass.<sup>15</sup>

Soga also welcomed the appearance in 1862 of *Indaba*, the first Xhosa newspaper, which he saw as a crucial vehicle for the expression of Xhosa nationhood.<sup>16</sup>

Tiyo Soga stands as one of the earliest representatives of a theme that has attracted increasing attention from African historians. The biblical narrative of God's salvific dealings with a chosen yet wayward nation, redeeming Israel from Egyptian slavery and restoring her from Babylonian exile, has frequently become an inspiration and prototype for African intellectuals and politicians concerned to find theological legitimacy for the quest of colonised African peoples for freedom and selfhood. 'African nationalism', wrote the late Adrian Hastings, 'has hardly existed except where it has been ethnically based, linguistically held together and biblically watered.'<sup>17</sup> The theory that the African race was the offspring of Ham, second son of Noah, was, of course, notoriously manipulated by white supremacists in both southern Africa and the United States to justify the subjugation of blacks, who were alleged to have inherited the patriarchal curse pronounced on Ham's son, Canaan.<sup>18</sup> For Soga, however, as for some African American theorists such as Alexander Crummell, the Hamitic theory was the basis, not of curse, but of promised blessing for the African race.<sup>19</sup> When yoked together with the Ethiopianism of Psalm 68, and Paul's unashamed affirmation of patriotism in Romans 9, it appeared to offer the Xhosa, and black Africans as a whole, the pledge that they had a unique role to play in the accomplishment of the divine purpose of salvation for all nations.

Tiyo Soga showed his enduring affection for Scotland by sending his four sons to study at the Universities of Glasgow or Edinburgh. His second son, John Henderson Soga, followed the Arts course in the University of Edinburgh from 1886 to 1890, before proceeding for ordination training at the United Presbyterian Synod Hall: he completed his father's translation of *The Pilgrim's Progress* into Xhosa and became not simply a missionary but also the first historian of the Xhosa nation.<sup>20</sup> Tiyo Soga himself died comparatively young, in 1871. His memorial inscription, written by the same Dr Anderson who had baptised him and prayed so memorably at his ordination, described him, among other distinctions, as 'an ardent patriot' and 'a model Caffrarian for the imitation and inspiration of his countrymen'.<sup>21</sup> Modern historians prefer to call him a precursor of pan-Africanism, even of African nationalism. John Brown's lectures delivered at 5 Queen Street, Edinburgh, inelastic though they may have been, played their part in grounding Soga's Xhosa patriotism and pan-Africanism on a biblical foundation.

## II: YUN CH'İHO

In modern Africa, Christianity has more often been the source or ally of national consciousness than its enemy, despite the protestations of much postcolonial rhetoric to the contrary. In Asia, the reverse has generally been the case, for obvious reasons. In the different parts of the Indian sub-continent, Hinduism, Buddhism, or Islam has succeeded in imposing monopolistic claims on national identity, whilst in China Christianity has borne the brunt of the anti-foreignism that has deep roots in Chinese history. The great exception to this generalisation in Asia is Korea, more particularly, since the Korean War, South Korea, where Christian allegiance and national identity have reinforced each other to an extent that relatively few African nations can match. Our second figure linking Edinburgh to the story of world Christianity has played a profound, if ambiguous, role in this process.

On, or shortly before, Monday, 13 June 1910 an aristocrat could have been observed checking in to Edinburgh's premier hotel, the Balmoral, on Princes Street. The Balmoral was, and no doubt still is, accustomed to welcoming guests of noble birth, but what was unusual about this one was that he was Korean. The Honourable Yun Ch'İho had come to attend the historic World Missionary Conference held in this very Assembly Hall. He was the only Korean Christian to do so, and one of only twenty non-western Christians among the 1,215 official delegates.<sup>22</sup> He was accompanied at the Balmoral by his American missionary minder, Bishop W. R. Lambuth, secretary of the Board of Missions of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South.<sup>23</sup> Yun owed his presence at Edinburgh to a personal invitation from the chairman of the conference, John R. Mott: 'You', wrote Mott, 'are pre-eminently the man to represent your important and beloved country. In view of God's mighty work it is most desirable that you be present at Edinburgh'.<sup>24</sup>

Yun Ch'İho was born in 1865, the son of a Confucian aristocrat who later attained ministerial rank in the Korean government; he was also one of the earliest members of the pro-Japanese Reform Party. As a child of a noble family, Yun received a privileged literary education in the Confucian classics. As a teenager he was sent to Japan to study the modernised governmental institutions established following the Meiji Restoration, and became fluent in Japanese. For the remainder of his life Yun was to be alternately fascinated and alarmed by Japan – fascinated by the example it set of how to transform a traditional Asian feudal society into a politically reformed and economically advanced modern state, but alarmed by the



implicit threat that its new-found military might posed to its neighbour. Yun was appointed to a secretarial post in the Korean Foreign Office, but in 1885, suspected of involvement in an unsuccessful coup led by a group of radical reformers, he fled to China. In Shanghai he enrolled as a student in the Methodist Episcopal institution, the Anglo-Chinese College, where in 1887 he became a Christian. Coming to the notice of the leading Methodist missionary, Young J. Allen, he was sent to study in the United States, first at Vanderbilt University in Nashville, then at Emory College (later University) in Oxford, Georgia. He was the first Korean to study in the United States, and it was there that he attracted the attention of John Mott. Yun returned to Korea in 1895 to take up a series of government posts, rising to the position of Acting Minister of Foreign Affairs from 1904 to 1906.<sup>25</sup> He resigned from government office in 1906 in protest at the imposition of a Japanese protectorate on Korea in November 1905.

Many of the verdicts passed on the World Missionary Conference in commemoration of its centenary have observed that the conference took place towards the high point of western imperial enthusiasm and have lamented that many of its pronouncements reflected that fact. What modern Christian commentators rarely notice, however, is that 1910 also marked a milestone in the emergence of a new Asian colonial power. Korea was fully annexed by Japan just two months after the Edinburgh conference, on 22 August 1910, and was to remain a Japanese colony for the rest of Yun's life until shortly after his death in 1945. The imperialism that preoccupied Yun Ch'iho during his stay in Edinburgh emanated not from the west but from Korea's neighbour to the east. The evidence we have from 1910 suggests that Yun was broadly supportive of the idea that western nations had a divine commission to disseminate Christian civilisation in Asia. He had drawn from Young J. Allen the principle that spiritual renewal was the key to the strengthening of a nation, and his sojourn in the States had convinced him that the superiority of western civilisation was attributable to the influence of the Christian faith.<sup>26</sup> He had also imbibed from his time at Vanderbilt a Christianised form of social Darwinism: Confucianism was 'backward' and 'degenerate', whereas Christian peoples had discovered the secret of national strength, and were destined to rule the world.<sup>27</sup>

Yun made three public contributions to the Edinburgh conference. The first was in the debate on the Commission I report on 'Carrying the Gospel to All the Non-Christian World'. He referred to the remarkably rapid expansion of the Korean Protestant churches, growing in the space of twenty-five years to a membership of nearly 200,000 Christians. But he

also warned of the consequent danger of shallow doctrinal understanding, combined with the revival of both Buddhism and Confucianism, and the growing influence of western materialist philosophies.<sup>28</sup> We should remember that he had become a Christian before he arrived at a social Darwinist understanding of Korean nationalism; for Yun, Christianity was not merely a means to a nationalist end. He also spoke in the debate on the Commission II report on 'The Church in the Mission Field', challenging the almost universally accepted principle that money contributed by western Christians should be under their control, and urging that national leaders be taken fully into consultation in the allocation of funds.<sup>29</sup> Thus Yun's enthusiasm for western civilisation did not blind him to the dangers of foreign domination of a young church. Nevertheless, his third address, given to the parallel conference for mission support workers held in the Synod Hall in Castle Terrace, combined an emphasis on the need for the 'Native Church' to develop its own self-supporting ministry with an assertion that non-Christian nations were bound to be attracted to Great Britain and America as exemplars of the principle that Christianity was the foundation 'of the highest type of modern civilization'.<sup>30</sup>

Yun made an impression at Edinburgh more by who he was – the most prominent Christian advocate of national reform and independence in Korea – than by what he said. It is more difficult to ascertain the impression that the conference made on him. He kept diaries which have been preserved, but unfortunately the diaries for the years from July 1906 to 1915 are missing. The reason they are missing is that in late 1911 Yun was imprisoned by the Japanese on suspicion of having conspired, unsuccessfully, to assassinate the Japanese Governor-General of Korea, Terauchi Masatake. Of the 124 persons so accused, ninety-eight were Christians. Yun was sentenced to ten years' imprisonment in September 1912 and remained in prison until granted an Imperial pardon in 1915.<sup>31</sup> We may deduce that his diary for 1910 was among those confiscated and destroyed by the prison authorities. We do, however, have a diary entry from much later in Yun's life, from 1940, which at first sight throws into question the extent of Yun's enthusiasm for the western Christian imperialism evident at Edinburgh in 1910:

In 1910 I went to Edinburgh to attend the World Missionary Conference. A Dr. [Alexander] White [Whyte], at a luncheon given in a large auditorium to the delegates representing a score of nations, wasted nearly an hour in eulogizing the achievements of the Anglo-Saxon nations – England and America. It was very ungentlemanly on

the part of the old fellow to indulge in such vulgar jingoism. Hitler will have done one good thing in the world if he succeeds in punching a big hole in the arrogance-ballo[o]n of the Anglo-Saxon pride – of the coarse Kipling type.<sup>32</sup>

This distant recollection of the then principal of New College should, however, be treated with caution as evidence of Yun's own views in 1910. The 'large auditorium' was in fact the Rainy Hall, and the occasion was a dinner given by the Senatus of New College to a hundred representative conference delegates.<sup>33</sup> Despite Alexander Whyte's after-dinner speech, Yun evidently communicated a high esteem for Edinburgh to his family: for his first cousin, once removed, Yun Bo-seon, entered the University of Edinburgh in 1925, and graduated MA with an aegrotat degree in 1930;<sup>34</sup> from 1960 to 1962 he was the fourth president of South Korea. Yun Ch'ihō himself withdrew from politics after his release from prison in 1915, and devoted himself to educational and YMCA work. By the late 1930s he had reversed his previous antipathy to Japanese rule and come to the prudential view that assimilation into the empire of Japan, as manifestly the 'fittest' nation to emerge from the struggle for supremacy in east Asia, offered the best hope for the advance of Korea to a position of national strength that would rival the western powers. Without abandoning his Christian faith, he now believed that Korea should be 'a Scotland of Japan, and never, no never, an Ireland of Japan'.<sup>35</sup> Looking back at the 1910 conference from this new political vantage point, he now regarded its Anglo-Saxon Christian imperialism with less favour than once he did. Yun's eventual conviction that the manifest destiny of the Korean nation lay in the hands of Japanese rather than western imperialism has left a lasting blot on his reputation in Korea. Nevertheless, the patriotic hymn, the *Aegugka*, almost certainly composed by Yun as early as 1896, was in 1937 adopted by the provisional government of Korea, in exile in Shanghai, as the Korean national anthem. Combining Confucian patriotism with some Christian motifs, it became the national anthem of the Republic of Korea in 1948, and survived partition as the national anthem of South Korea, though it was no longer sung to the tune of *Auld Lang Syne*, as it had been by Korean exiles throughout the Japanese colonial period.<sup>36</sup>

Our instinctive responses to the respective amalgams of Christianity and nationalism represented by Tiyo Soga and Yun Ch'ihō are ambiguous and possibly inconsistent. We are inclined to give a favourable verdict on African nationalism because it was generally anti-colonial (though

Soga's was not), often broadly Christian in inspiration, and because we can identify it with such widely acclaimed leaders as Julius Nyerere or Nelson Mandela. We are less sure about Korean Protestant nationalism, perhaps because it reminds us uncomfortably of our own dubious forms of Christian nationalism in Europe or the United States. Contemporary Korean Protestantism retains much of the distinctive synthesis that Yun Ch'ih'o himself displayed of a compelling sense of Christian world mission, an exaggerated reverence for certain aspects of the western cultural inheritance, and a deep indebtedness to other religious or cultural motifs of indigenous origin.

### III: JOHN ALEXANDER DOWIE

Our third and final figure is a Scot, a native of Edinburgh, though he did not spend much of his life there. John Alexander Dowie was born in Edinburgh on 25 May 1847, but at the age of thirteen his family emigrated to Adelaide, following in the footsteps of his uncle, Alexander.<sup>37</sup> Sensing a call of God to Christian ministry, Dowie left Australia in 1869 to enter the University of Edinburgh, where he studied literary and philosophical subjects in the Faculty of Arts, though he never took his degree.<sup>38</sup> It is also recorded that he took voluntary theological courses 'in the Free Church School', in other words at New College.<sup>39</sup> His academic career was undistinguished, but we know that he served as an unofficial chaplain in the Edinburgh Royal Infirmary, which entitled him to attend lectures in medicine, including some by the celebrated Sir James Young Simpson, and also observe operations, surgical procedures which in the early 1870s frequently had fatal consequences. As he heard professors 'admit that they were only guessing in the dark' in their diagnoses, Dowie imbibed a scepticism toward the medical profession that remained with him for the rest of his life.<sup>40</sup>

On his return to Australia Dowie was ordained into the Congregational ministry on 21 April 1872, and was called to the pastorate of a church at Alma, near Adelaide. He also married his cousin, Jane, daughter of his uncle, Alexander. The Alma ministry, and two subsequent Congregational pastorates in Sydney, proved short-lived, but in the course of these early pastorates Dowie discovered a dimension of Christian ministry for which New College had not quite prepared him. In the course of an epidemic that was devastating Sydney in 1874, Dowie was called to the bedside of a dying girl and was led to pray for her immediate healing. She was healed, after which not one more person in his congregation died from the epidemic. Dowie became convinced that all disease was the 'foul offspring

of its father, Satan, and its mother Sin', and that the atoning work of Christ included deliverance from sickness as the work of the devil.<sup>41</sup> From late 1877 Dowie ministered in a series of independent chapels or tabernacles in Sydney and Melbourne, where in 1882 he founded the International Divine Healing Association. Dowie established contacts with holiness teachers in Britain and North America who were developing a similar interest in divine healing. In March 1888 Dowie, his wife and two children, left Melbourne for California.

His original intention was to attend a convention on divine healing in England, but his healing services up and down the Pacific coast were so well received that he decided to stay on in America. In 1889 he began publication of a newspaper, *Leaves of Healing*, which had first appeared in Australia, and in the summer of 1890 settled in Evanston, Illinois.<sup>42</sup> He persuaded himself that the morally notorious metropolis of Chicago should be the centre of his future ministry, and in 1893 he erected a wooden tabernacle just across the street from the entrance to the World's Columbian Exposition (or World's Fair). His healing miracles began to draw the crowds, and a wall of the tabernacle was adorned with discarded crutches and leg braces, 'trophies captured from the enemy' and displayed in the shape of a crown under the motto 'Christ is all'.<sup>43</sup> Dowie's congregation soon outgrew the tabernacle, and for a time he leased the Chicago Auditorium, which he filled with crowds of over 4,000, before taking over a disused Episcopal church on Michigan Avenue for his services. In February 1896 he formed 'the Christian Catholic Church' in an endeavour to replicate the apostolic pattern of the New Testament church.<sup>44</sup>

Dowie was becoming a Chicago celebrity of some notoriety. In *Leaves of Healing* for 30 September 1899 he declared 'A Three Months' Holy War against the Hosts of Hell in Chicago'.<sup>45</sup> Prominent among the hosts of hell were the liquor and tobacco interests, which he attacked, as he had in Australia, with the passion of a social gospeller. He was also vehement in his condemnation of racism, notably of the lynchings of African Americans.<sup>46</sup> Less typically of the social gospel, the hosts of hell also included the medical profession: when Dowie announced that he was to lecture on the topic 'Doctors, Drugs, and Devils', 2,000 medical students organised themselves to disrupt the meeting.<sup>47</sup> Perhaps not ranked among the hosts of hell, but sadly not clearly identified with the hosts of Zion, in Dowie's view, were the historic denominations: it was time, he declared, that the Baptists, founders of the University of Chicago, were 'utterly smashed'; the Congregationalists he dismissed as 'living on the Pilgrim

Fathers' dust; the brains of a dead theology'; and as for the Presbyterians, 'if there is a miserable people on God Almighty's earth, it is you'.<sup>48</sup>

The Holy War came to a sudden end on New Year's Eve, 1899, when Dowie announced to his congregation that he had purchased a 6,500-acre site in Lake County on the shores of Lake Michigan for the construction of 'Zion City'. Dowie had abandoned the attempt to make godless Chicago conform to the values of the kingdom, and now sought to erect a theocratic polity, ruled by himself as 'General Overseer', in which there would be:

NO – Breweries or Saloons, Gambling Hells, Houses of Ill-Fame, Hog-Raising, Selling, Handling, Drug or Tobacco Shops. NO – Hospitals or Doctor's Offices, Theaters or Dance Halls, Secret Lodges, or Apostate Churches, Bad Books, Pictures, or Papers or Any of the Curses or Abominations which Defile the Spirits, Souls, and Bodies of Men.<sup>49</sup>

Dowie purchased the site on an 1,100-year lease: 100 years in which to found other Zion cities, and prepare the way for the return of Christ, which was anticipated before the year 2000, followed by 1,000 years for the millennial reign of Christ on earth.<sup>50</sup> Despite such apparent other-worldliness, the city was to be economically self-supporting, principally by means of a lace factory. Samuel Stevenson, a sympathetic lace manufacturer from Beeston in Nottinghamshire, and a labour force of English lace workers, were recruited to run it. 'Godliness is profitable' was one of Dowie's favourite mottoes. There was tremendous public interest in purchasing plots in Zion City, and the godly lace factory did indeed make a profit. In fact, lace production continued until the 1950s.<sup>51</sup> The avenues of the new city were given biblical names, such as Antioch or Elijah, but with two exceptions – Caledonia and Edina.<sup>52</sup> The streets of the New Jerusalem thus retained echoes of Scotland and its capital.

On 2 June 1901, a month before the official opening of Zion City, Dowie declared himself to be the 'Messenger of the Covenant', the Prophet of whom Moses spoke in Deuteronomy 18, and 'Elijah the Restorer', with a divine commission to restore the 'primitive Christian catholic apostolic church'.<sup>53</sup> In September 1904 he went further still, donning resplendent high-priestly robes and proclaiming himself as the 'First Apostle of the Lord Jesus, the Christ, in the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion, who is also Elijah, the Prophet of the Restoration of All Things'.<sup>54</sup> Like many self-appointed charismatic leaders before and after him, Dowie's self-investment with theocratic power went to his head, and both the spiritual

and economic health of the new Jerusalem deteriorated rapidly from now onwards. In 1906 he was deposed by his own lieutenants, and died in the following year, a broken man.

You may well be asking why I have selected such an eccentric Scottish export to Illinois for inclusion in a lecture on world Christianity, given that by 'world Christianity' we generally mean Christianity outside of Europe and North America. The answer lies in the influence which these strange events on the shores of Lake Michigan exerted on the continent of Africa. Zion City was intended from the first to be a missionary light to all nations: *Leaves of Healing* was circulated internationally, and a missionary organisation, known originally as 'the Seventies', was created to spread the message of Zion to other American cities and overseas.

Bishop Bengt Sundkler, after conducting his pioneering research among the Zionist churches among Zulus and Swazis in the 1950s and 1960s, reported that, when asked about the originator of their movement, Zionist leaders characteristically gave the answer, 'John Alexander, First Apostle'.<sup>55</sup> The principal connection lies through the Dutch Reformed missionary, Petrus Le Roux, a disciple of another remarkable Scot and advocate of divine healing, Andrew Murray. In 1897 Le Roux was introduced to *Leaves of Healing* by a Swiss missionary, Johannes Büchler, who was in contact with Dowie and responsible for inviting one of Dowie's missionaries, Daniel Bryant, to Johannesburg.<sup>56</sup> Le Roux was persuaded by what he read and heard from Bryant, and began teaching his Zulu congregation at Wakkerstroom in the eastern Transvaal that Jesus wants to be our *inyanga* [traditional healer] 'to heal us when we are sick in body'.<sup>57</sup> In 1903 he resigned from the Dutch Reformed Church to form his own church, the first black Zionist congregation on the African continent. Le Roux may also be seen as the progenitor of South African Pentecostalism. In July 1908 he attended meetings in Doornfontein conducted by John G. Lake, one of Dowie's elders from Zion City who had entered into a full Pentecostal experience of the Holy Spirit through influence from the Azusa Street revival in Los Angeles. Le Roux was persuaded of the new Pentecostal teaching and became first president of the Apostolic Faith Mission, formed in 1908 as the first Pentecostal organisation in South Africa.<sup>58</sup> There was a progressive parting of the ways on racial lines between the predominantly white Apostolic Faith Mission and the black Zionist movement. The former pioneered white Pentecostal congregations in South Africa and, after 1916, in what is now Zimbabwe; the latter developed over the coming decades into the most influential expression of Christianity among the South African black population.<sup>59</sup>



The ripples emanating from Zion City extended not just to southern Africa, but to West Africa as well.<sup>60</sup> Here the influence was less direct, but identifiable nonetheless. In late 1896 a former Methodist minister who had joined Zion City, Abraham Wilhilde, established his own divine healing church in Philadelphia. In June 1898 this church became formally affiliated to Dowie's Christian Catholic Church. The link was broken after the collapse of Dowie's reign over Zion City in 1906, but many of the church's members joined forces with another healing fellowship, known since 1904 as Faith Tabernacle, founded by another admirer of Dowie, John Wesley Ankins, a former Baptist minister. Faith Tabernacle issued its own magazine, *Sword of the Spirit*, and from 1908 sent out its own missionaries. Within a decade the *Sword of the Spirit* had reached missionary and African readers in Nigeria and Ghana. Branches of Faith Tabernacle sprang up in both countries. The appeal of a new church that proclaimed Christ's continuing power to heal all the sick in answer to prayer was reinforced by the disastrous influenza epidemic of 1918–19, which killed an estimated half a million Nigerians and 100,000 Ghanaians.<sup>61</sup> Among those who read the *Sword of the Spirit* were two Yoruba Anglican laymen, J. B. Sadare and David Ogunleye Odubanjo. Odubanjo planted the first Tabernacle congregation in Nigeria, on Lagos Island, and in December 1923 Sadare and some sixty of his followers joined the congregation. In the same year a second congregation was established in the Lagos suburb of Ebute Metta, from which clerks and traders spread Faith Tabernacle teaching by means of the new Nigeria Railway right up into northern Nigeria. In 1929 Joseph Babalola, another Anglican, from northern Nigeria, joined the Ebute Metta congregation. He was to become the key leader in a massive healing revival that swept through Yorubaland in 1930–1. Odubanjo formed links with missionaries sent out by the Apostolic Church, a Pentecostal denomination with its roots in the Welsh revival. In 1941 Babalola and Odubanjo were instrumental in leading many of the Faith Tabernacle congregations in Nigeria into a new African instituted church, the Christ Apostolic Church, one of the 'Aladura' or 'praying' churches of Nigeria.<sup>62</sup> In Nigeria, in addition to the Christ Apostolic Church, the Apostolic Church and the Assemblies of God both owe their origins to Faith Tabernacle.<sup>63</sup>

A similar story can be told from Ghana, where there were by the end of the 1920s at least 135 branches of Faith Tabernacle, with up to 4,000 adherents.<sup>64</sup> The Apostolic Church in Ghana and two African Pentecostal churches that seceded from it—the Christ Apostolic Church and the Church of Pentecost—all owe their origins to Faith Tabernacle leaders.



Adam Mohr estimates that in Nigeria and Ghana together, the churches that trace their history to Faith Tabernacle have an aggregate membership of between eight and fifteen million.<sup>65</sup> In Ghana, however, some of the earliest occurrences of Pentecostalism can be traced to the contacts of Thomas Brem-Wilson, a member of the Gold Coast émigré population in London, who owed his initial conviction of the transforming power of the Holy Spirit to participation in the Euston Road branch of Dowie's Christian Catholic Church; he also visited Zion City itself in 1904.<sup>66</sup>

#### IV: CONCLUSION

Tiyo Soga, Yun Ch'iho, and John Alexander Dowie represent divergent trajectories of development in the story of world Christianity over the last 150 years, though in each case the trajectory passes through the city of Edinburgh. Tiyo Soga is emblematic of a powerful tradition in modern African Christianity that has found in the pages of Christian Scripture validation of a sense of the God-given dignity and spiritual significance of black people. Whilst he himself supported British colonial rule as a vehicle of 'civilisation' among his people, his example inspired later generations to combat colonial exploitation in the name of the values that he found in the Bible. If the scandal of white domination in southern Africa is inexplicable without the ambiguous role played by the churches, it is also happily the case that the story of opposition to apartheid in South Africa and settler domination in Rhodesia cannot be told without making reference to the tradition of African Christian patriotism, of which Soga was one of the chief architects. Yun Ch'iho also saw no incompatibility between Christian faith and the defence of nationhood. In his case, however, his opposition to Japanese suppression of Korean national aspirations depended less obviously on his reading of Scripture and derived instead from a synthesis between Christian allegiance and Darwinian notions of national struggle and superiority. Perhaps that was why he found it difficult to maintain a consistent attitude to Japanese control of the Korean peninsula. Nevertheless, he reminds us that issues of how Christians should respond to the restless imperial ambitions of nations, whether western or eastern, are, and will remain, a constant theme of church history, and are in no way restricted to the challenges posed by the western colonial dominance of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Dowie stands in marked contrast to the other two, for he eventually abandoned the quest to bring American national life into harmony with the kingdom of God and sought instead to anticipate the coming kingdom through the construction of a visible terrestrial New Jerusalem. His theological edifice

may appear the shakiest of this trio, yet the reality is that he is the one who has left the greatest imprint on the face of world Christianity today. He can be criticised for collapsing the biblical tension between the 'already' and the 'not yet', but he remained absolutely consistent in a country divided by racial antagonism to the principle that in the city of God there can be no distinction between black and white. Above all, for millions of Christians in the southern hemisphere today, his insistence that the salvation that Jesus came to impart is for the body as well as the soul, and for this life as well as the life to come, is at the very heart of their faith.

**Brian Stanley** is Professor of World Christianity and Director of the Study of World Christianity, University of Edinburgh. His research focuses on the modern Protestant missionary movement from the eighteenth century to the present day, and its contemporary appropriation. His most recent book is *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910* (Eerdmans, 2009) and with Professor Robert E. Frykenberg, he is co-editor of the Eerdmans series, *Studies in the History of Christian Missions*. As from 2012 he will be assuming the editorship of *Studies in World Christianity*.

## NOTES

1. Andrew C. Ross. 1996. *Blantyre Mission and the Making of Modern Malawi*. Blantyre: CLAIM, pp. 177–8; Kenneth R. Ross. November 1997. 'Crisis and Identity—Presbyterian Ecclesiology in Southern Malawi, 1891–1993', *Missiology* 25 (3): 381–97.
2. See the scripturally evocative title of the pamphlet published in commemoration of the jubilee of the World Missionary Conference: Hugh Martin. 1960. *Beginning at Edinburgh...* London: Edinburgh House Press.
3. John M'Kerrow. 1867. *History of the Foreign Missions of the Secession and United Presbyterian Church*. Edinburgh: Andrew Elliot, p. 446.
4. The standard modern biography is Donovan Williams. 1978. *Umfundisi: A Biography of Tiyo Soga 1829–1871*. Lovedale: Lovedale Press. On the Soga family see Janet Hodgson. 1986. 'Soga and Dukwana: the Christian Struggle for Liberation in mid-19<sup>th</sup>-century South Africa', *Journal of Religion in Africa* 16 (3): 187–208; and Richard Price. 2008. *Making Empire: Colonial Encounters and the Creation of Imperial Rule in Nineteenth-Century Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 117–19.
5. John Aitken Chalmers. 1857. *Tiyo Soga: A Page of South African Mission Work*. Edinburgh: Andrew Elliot, pp. 72–80; *Proceedings of the Synod of the United Presbyterian Church Held at Edinburgh, May, 1856*. Edinburgh: James Hogg, p. 679; William MacKelvie. 1873. *Annals and Statistics of the United Presbyterian Church*. Edinburgh: Oliphant and Co., and Andrew Elliot; and Glasgow: David Robertson, p. 696; David Wright. 1996. 'Elsewhere in Edinburgh: colleges newer and older', in David F. Wright and Gary Badcock (eds), *Disruption to Diversity: Edinburgh Divinity, 1846–1996*, p. 251. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark.
6. M'Kerrow, *History of the Foreign Missions of the Secession and United Presbyterian Church*, 445. On Anderson (1799–1873) see MacKelvie, *Annals and Statistics*, 302, and

- Robert Small. 1904. *History of the Congregations of the United Presbyterian Church from 1733 to 1900*, 2 vols. Edinburgh: David M. Small, II, pp. 47–9.
7. Chalmers, *Tiyo Soga*, 89.
8. P. Landreth. 1876. *The United Presbyterian Divinity Hall, in its Changes and Enlargements for One Hundred and Forty Years*. Edinburgh: William Oliphant & Co., p. 286.
9. Williams, *Umfundisi*, 23.
10. Chalmers, *Tiyo Soga*, 83–4.
11. Preface to John Brown. 1857. *Analytical Exposition of the Epistle of Paul the Apostle to the Romans*. Edinburgh: William Oliphant & Sons, p. ix.
12. Brown, *Analytical Exposition of Romans*, 301.
13. Williams, *Umfundisi*, 91–104.
14. Cited in Williams, *Umfundisi*, 95.
15. *Ibid.*, 100.
16. *Ibid.*, 98.
17. Adrian Hastings. 1997. *The Construction of Nationhood: Ethnicity: Religion and Nationalism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p. 163.
18. On this theme see Colin Kidd. 2006. *The Forging of Races: Race and Scripture in the Protestant Atlantic World, 1600–2000*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 35–41; David N. Livingstone. 2008. *Adam's Ancestors: Race, Religion, and the Politics of Human Origins*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, pp. 14, 184, 192.
19. For Crummell's use of the Hamitic theory see Kidd, *The Forging of Races*, 251–2.
20. J. Henderson Soga. *The South-Eastern Bantu (Abe-Nguni, Ana-Mbo, Ama-Lala)*. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press, pp. xi–xv; Isabel Hofmeyr. 2004. *The Portable Bunyan: A Transnational History of The Pilgrim's Progress*. Princeton, N. J. and Oxford: Princeton University Press, p. 118.
21. National Library of Scotland, MS 7652, Letter Book of United Presbyterian Church Foreign Mission Board, fol. 469. For Anderson's authorship see NLS, MS 7651, Letter Book of United Presbyterian Church Foreign Mission Board, fol. 974.
22. To the nineteen names listed in my *The World Missionary Conference: Edinburgh 1910* (2009. Grand Rapids and Cambridge: Eerdmans, p. 91), should be added that of Grace Stephens, a Eurasian Methodist from Madras.
23. The Burke Library at Union Theological Seminary, New York (Columbia University), World Missionary Conference papers, series 1, box 24, folder 5, item 532, 'List of Addresses Registered by Delegates During the Conference', p. 58.
24. Yale Divinity School, RG45, Mott papers, box 101, folder 1782, Mott to Yun Ch'ihō, 1 Feb. 1910.
25. There is no published biography of Yun Ch'ihō, but the two fullest treatments are Keun de Ceuster. 1994. *From Modernization to Collaboration: The Dilemma of Korean Cultural Nationalism: The Case of Yun Ch'ihō (1865–1945)*, 2 vols. Leuven: Katholieke Universiteit Leuven.; and Shin Ahn. 2006. 'From conversion to transformation: a religious interpretation of Yun Chi-ho (1865–1945)' (University of Edinburgh PhD thesis).
26. De Ceuster, *From Modernization to Collaboration*, II, 633–4.
27. Vladimir Tikhonov. August 2002. 'Social Darwinism in Korea and its influence on early modern Korean Buddhism', *International Journal of Korean History* 2: 65–97.
28. World Missionary Conference, 1910, *Report of Commission I*. Edinburgh and London: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier; and New York, Chicago, and Toronto: Fleming H. Revell

- Company, n.d. [1910]), 410–11; W. H. T. Gairdner. 1910. *'Edinburgh 1910': an account and interpretation of the World Missionary Conference*. Edinburgh and London: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, pp. 79, 98.
29. World Missionary Conference, 1910, *Report of Commission II*, 358–9; Gairdner, *'Edinburgh 1910'*, 106.
30. Yun Ch'ih'o, 'The place of the native church in the work of evangelization', address given in the Synod Hall, Edinburgh, 17 June 1910. I am grateful to Mrs Yunice Min, Yun's great-niece, for supplying the text of this address. It is not included in World Missionary Conference, 1910, *The History and Records of the Conference Together with Addresses Delivered at the Evening Meetings*. Edinburgh and London: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier; and New York, Chicago, and Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Company, n.d. [1910]), though the address is listed in the programme of Synod Hall meetings on p. 122.
31. Arthur Judson Brown, 1912 *The Korean Conspiracy Case*. Northfield, MA: Northfield Press; James Huntley Grayson. 2002. *Korea—A Religious History*, revised edition. London: RoutledgeCurzon, p. 160; Shin Ahn 'From conversion to transformation', 150–1.
32. Yun Ch'ih'o's *Diary Volume 11*, 5 November 1940. 1989. Seoul: National History Compilation Committee, pp. 349–50.
33. See G. F. Barbour. 1923. *The Life of Alexander Whyte D.D.* London: Hodder & Stoughton, p. 524. Alexander Whyte (1836–1921) was principal of New College from 1909 to 1918.
34. Edinburgh University archives, INI/ADS/STA/5, Graduates in Arts, 1930, entry for Yun, Posun.
35. Yun Ch'ih'o's *Diary Volume 11*, 1 March 1943, p. 436, cited by Shin Ahn, 'From conversion to transformation', 219.
36. Shin Ahn, 'From conversion to transformation', 274–8.
37. The fullest sources on Dowie are Rolvix Harlan. 1906. *John Alexander Dowie and the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion*. Evansville, Wis.; Gordon Lindsay. 1951. *The Life of John Alexander Dowie whose Trials-Tragedies-and Triumphs are the Most Fascinating Object Lesson of Christian History*. n.p.: Voice of Healing Publishing Company.; and Philip L. Cook. 1996. *Zion City, Illinois: Twentieth-Century Utopia*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press. Cook is by far the most scholarly treatment.
38. Edinburgh University archives, INI/ADS/STA/4, First Matriculation Book, 1869–70, No. 724; INI/ADS/STA/2, Matriculation Book, 1861–74, matriculation entries for 1870–1, No. 1198. Oddly his matriculation entry for his second year incorrectly lists his birthplace as Adelaide rather than Edinburgh.
39. Lindsay, *Life of Dowie*, 14; Cook, *Zion City*, 6, 230 fn. 8.
40. Lindsay, *Life of Dowie*, 15; Cook, *Zion City*, 6.
41. Lindsay, *Life of Dowie*, 22–5; Cook, *Zion City*, 8.
42. Lindsay, *Life of Dowie*, 85–94; Cook, *Zion City*, 10.
43. Cook, *Zion City*, 12, 15–16, 26; *Leaves of Healing*. 4 January 1895. Vol. 1, No. 16: 247, 256.
44. Cook, *Zion City*, 25; Lindsay, *Life of Dowie*, 152.
45. *Leaves of Healing*. 30 September 1899. Vol. V, No. 49: 954.
46. *Leaves of Healing*. 6 April 1901. Vol. VIII, No. 24: 751–2.
47. Lindsay, *Life of Dowie*, 162; Cook, *Zion City*, 20–1.
48. Cook, *Zion City*, 21.
49. *Ibid.*, 55.

50. *Ibid.*
51. *Ibid.*, 35–9, 135.
52. *Ibid.*, 61.
53. *Leaves of Healing*. 8 June 1901. Vol. IX, No. 7: 196–203.
54. *Leaves of Healing*. 24 September 1901. Vol. XV, No. 23: 789, 793–800; Cook, *Zion City*, 57, 171–2.
55. Bengt Sundkler. 1976. *Zulu Zion and Some Swazi Zionists*. London: Oxford University Press, pp. 14, 68.
56. Büchler visited Zion City in about 1893. Though disillusioned by Dowie's autocratic ways, he remained an advocate of divine healing, and invited Bryant to South Africa. See Sundkler, *Zulu Zion*, 30–1; Walter Hollenweger. 1972. *The Pentecostals*. London: SCM Press, pp. 120–1; David Maxwell. 1999. 'Historicizing Christian independency: the southern African Pentecostal movement', *Journal of African History* 40: 243–64; idem, 2006. *African Gifts of the Spirit: Pentecostalism and the Rise of a Zimbabwean Transnational Religious Movement*. Oxford: James Currey, pp. 39–40.
57. Sundkler, *Zulu Zion*, 25.
58. *Ibid.*, 52–3.
59. For an excellent treatment of this two-fold line of descent see Maxwell, *African Gifts of the Spirit*.
60. This paragraph is dependent on Adam Mohr, 2010. 'Out of Zion and into Philadelphia and West Africa: Faith Tabernacle congregation, 1897–1925', *Pneuma* 32: 56–79.
61. Mohr, 'Out of Zion', 72.
62. For a full account see J. D. Y. Peel. 1968. *Aladura: A Religious Movement among the Yoruba*. London: Oxford University Press, pp. 63–112.
63. Mohr, 'Out of Zion', 78.
64. *Ibid.*, 75.
65. *Ibid.*, 78–9.
66. David Killingray. 2010. 'An African Pentecostal pioneer in Peckham: the life of Thomas Brem-Wilson (1865–1929)', unpublished paper. I am much indebted to Professor Killingray for sending me a copy of his paper, and also electronic copies of *Leaves of Healing*.